ON MUSLIM VOTING FOR NON-MUSLIM LEADERS
A Qur'anic Perspective

Makrum
IAIN Pekalongan, Indonesia
makrum.kholil@yahoo.co.id

Abstract

This paper examines the Quranic perspective on Muslim voting for non-Muslim candidate leader in the election. It discusses the position of non-Muslim in a majority Muslim and democratic Indonesia and serves as a response to contemporary political rallies against the candidacy of non-Muslim. The Jakarta Governor election in 2017 clearly demonstrated how Muslim politics define non-Muslim in democracy. Examining important concepts on leadership, mainly the doctrine of khalīfah, uli al-amr, imām, and awliyā', explained in the Qur'an, this article further argues that this holy scripture has defined criteria of leader for the Muslim. Faith and competencies of leadership candidate serve as main references when Muslim send their vote in the election. In political affairs or nashb al-imāmah, Muslim is supposed to vote for Muslim candidate while also having obligation to guarantee the fulfillment of civic rights, particularly for non-Muslim.

[Artikel ini mengkaji perspektif Quran terkait pilihan politik dalam pemilu; yakni dalam menentukan pilihan politik yang dihadapkan dengan pilihan kandidat pemimpin non-muslim dalam pemilihan umum (pemilu). Pada hal lain, artikel ini juga mengulas posisi politik non-Muslim dalam negara mayoritas Muslim dan democrasi seperti Indonesia, sekaligus menjadi respon terhadap berbagai demonstrasi oleh umat Islam yang menentang kadidat non-Muslim dalam pemilu. Pemilu Gubernur Jakarta tahun 2017

lalu memperlihatkan bagaimana umat Islam menempatkan non-Muslim dalam demokrasi. Mengulas beberapa konsep penting dalam al-Quran, utama doktrin tentang khalīfah, uli al-amr, imām, and awliyā', artikel ini menggambarkan bahwa sumber utama umat Islam, al-Quran, menjelaskan krtiteria bagi pemimpin umat Islam. Faktor agama dan kompetesi tentu saja menjadi salah satu pertimbangan mereka dalam memilih pemimpin. Dalam ranah politik atau nashb al-imāmah, setiap Muslim sudah seharusnya memilih kandidat beragama Islam meski mereka juga berkewiban menjunjung tinggi hak kewargaan, utamanya bagi non-Muslim.

Keywords: *Kāfir, Non-Muslim, Qur'an*

Introduction

At the eve of Jakarta Governor election in 2017, the issue of Muslim voting for non-Muslim candidate in the election has escalated tension between Muslim and non-Muslim in Indonesia. The tension was exacerbating as the non-Muslim candidate for the governorship who was also the incumber governor, Basuki Tjahaja Purnama, popularly known as Ahok, commented on the issue of Muslim voting for non-Muslim through his speech in September 2016. He quoted the Qur'an (al-Maidah: 51) and argued that voting for non-Muslim is lawful in Islam. Following his statement, an edited video of statement became viral in social-media platforms and incited major controversies as Ahok was accused of committing religious blasphemy. Muslim groups, particularly the hardliners, organised a series of political rallies under the heading of "*Aksi 411*" on 4 November 2016 and "*Aksi 212*" on 2 December 2016 under the auspices of *Aksi Bela Islam*.[1] The rallies called the Indonesian government to arrest Ahok and sent him to jail for violating the Indonesia's blasphemy law. Responding to the rallies, there has been a dissenting opinion within the Muslim. The latter group that

---

[1] Furthermore discussion on *Aksi Bela Islam,* read an interesting paper, *Muzayyin Ahyar, Alfitri Alfitri,* "Aksi Bela Islam: Islamic Clicktivism and the New Authority of Religious Propaganda in the Millennial Age in Indonesia," *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* (IJIMS), Vol. 9, No. 1, 2019.

particularly consists of mainstream Indonesia Muslim organisations, such as Nahdlatul Ulama and Muhammadiyah, contested the rallies and tried to neutralised the political tension that could lead to riots.

This article aims to offer the Quranic perspective on the issues of Muslim politics and rights of non-Muslim in political election. It closely examines important concepts in the Qur'an related to leadership and Muslim participation in election. This article uses the thematic interpretation method (*mawdhû'i*) with which it seeks to answer the Quranic perspective on Muslim participation in the election, Muslim vote for non-Muslim leader, and Muslim politics in a country of neither Islamic nor secular state, Indonesia. It further argues that the Qur'an has explained general guidelines of Muslim politics and religion serves as one of the criteria for leadership of Muslim communities. Despite the Quranic criteria for leadership that lays the notion of faith, Muslim is also given an obligation to ensure the fulfilment of civic rights, particularly for the non-Muslim. Muslim favouritism in the election should not violate the rights of every citizen, importantly when the state is neither secular nor Islamic state.

Muslim, *Kāfir*, *Fāsiq* and *Munāfiq*

The Qur'an has provided general guidelines for leadership. Religious category does serve as one of important criteria for Muslim in their preference for leadership. In addition to religious category, ethical competencies and professional experiences are included as the criteria for leadership. Hereby, I would like to introduce some important concepts related to religion to give a glimpse overview general definition on Quranic concepts on leadership which include the terms of Muslim, *kāfir*, *fāsiq* and *munāfiq*. The concepts appear in the Qur'and and become important concepts as explaining Muslim politics, particularly as they select their political leaders.

The word "*muslim*" -referring to subject in Arabic grammar (*isim fā'il*) with its various derivations- frequently appears in the Qur'an. As subject in a single form, it appears three times and thirty-eight times in a plural form or *mutsannā*.[2] The word particularly refers to person who submit his/herself to Allah (al-Hujurat: 14). A Muslim is the one who believes in God and his Prophet Muhammad as His messenger, and obey God's rules.[3] The word "*muslim*" is often contrasted to the concept of "*kāfir*". This later concept appears in the Qur'an (al-Kafirun: 1, at-Taubah: 40, al-Mumtahanah: 10, an-Nisa': 89, 141, 150, Fathir: 39, al-Mukmin: 10, al-Hajj: 19, 72, An-Naba': 40, an-Nur: 39) which literally means religious infidel. It refers to the one who conceals or denies the truth regardless partial denial or entire renunciation.[4] The term "*kāfir*" is also used to mention those who reject Islamic massages and non-Muslim. In addition to religious denial, the term *kāfir* -also in its derivations in verb forms (*fi'il*)- also connotes negative attitude or acts of violating ethical norms, regardless of his/her faith. In this regard, it has a similar meaning to *inkar (deny), shirk (unlawful association), fusûq (sinner), zulm (unjust), fujûr (wrong), jurm (crime), fasād (broken)* and else. This later understanding mainly appears in verb-form (*fi'il*), whereas the subject-noun form implies non-Muslim.[5]

The word "*fasiq*" derived from Arabic "*fasaqa-yafsuqu-fusqan*" means to get out of something.[6] It appears in the Qur'an (Ali Imran: 82, al-Maidah: 47, al-A'raf: 145, al-Hujurat: 6, al-Hadid: 27, al-Ahqaf: 20) and, for Ibn

---

[2] Tim Sembilan, *Tafsir Maudhu'i Al-Muntaha* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pesantren, 2004), p. 85-86.

[3] Abu Al-Fida' Ismail bin Katsir Al-Dimasyqiy, *Tafsir Al-Qur'an Al-Azhim*, (Semarang: Thaha Putra, t.t.), p. 218-219.

[4] Moh. Rofiq, "Konsep Kufr dalam Al-Qur'an", *Jurnal Sahaja*, Vol. 4, No. 2, 2013, pp. 68-82.

[5] Harifuddin Cawidu, *Konsep Kufr dalam Al-Qur'an: Suatu Kajian Teologis dengan Pendekatan Tafsir Tematik* (Jakarta: Penerbit Bulan Bintang, 1991).

[6] Abu Abdillah al-Qurthubiy, *Tafsir al-Qurthubiy* (Cairo: Dar asy-Syiab, 1372 H), p. 245.

Zakariya', points to religiously nonconforming acts and attitude.[7] It is used to mention believers in Islam who violates the *sharia* (rules of religion).[8] The word *fāsiq* has a similar meaning to the concept of "*munāfiq*" – also in its derivative forms (al-Munāfiqun: 1, at-Tauba: 67, 79, al-Ahzab: 60, al-Hasyr: 11, and Ali Imran: 167). Ibn Kathir argues, *munāfiq* is hypocrite or a person conceals his negative intention and goal.[9] In a prophetic tradition (*hadīth*), the Prophet Muhammad characterised the *munāfiq* as: the liar, the hypocrite, and the one who breaks promise. The act of hypocrisy is close to the act of *kufr* (denial). The Qur'an records that a hypocrite will be concealing disbelief and actively sought to undermine the Muslim. The hypocrite will conceal his/her nature for pragmatic reasons.[10]

As far as the aforementioned discussion, it can be summarised that a "Muslims" is a believer in Islam and otherwise the "*kāfir*" is disbeliever or the one who denies the truth of Islam. "*Fāsiq*" on the other hand is a Muslim who does not practice God's order and committ acts against God's rules and the word "*munāfiq*" refers to double-tongue person. Throughout the history of Islam, these four concepts had been used as political frames for the cause of politics. As we see the years following the death of the Prophet Muhammad, these four concepts have sacrificed the unity of Muslim and assassinations on behalf of religion were carried under the banner of these four concepts.

As the early history of Islam shows, during the reign of the third caliph Uthman ibn Affan, the political conflicts had major consequences culminating to the assassination of the caliph.[11] The conflict cause wars

---

[7] Abu Husain Ahmad bin Faris bin Zakariya bin Hubaib ar-Razi, *Mu'jam Muqayis al-Lughah* (Cairo: Maktabah al-Kanji, 1981), p. 356.

[8] Harifuddin Cawidu, *Konsep Kufr dalam Al-Qur'an…*, p. 54.

[9] Abu Al-Fida' Ismail bin Katsir Al-Dimasyqiy, *Tafsir Al-Qur'an Al-Azhim*, (Semarang: Thaha Putra, t.t.), pp. 218-219.

[10] Moh. Rofiq, "Konsep Kufr dalam Al-Qur'an", *Jurnal Sahaja*, Vol. 4, No. 2, 2013, p. 73.

[11] Shalih Khuraisat, *Tahdzib Tarikh at-Thabari: Tarikh al-Umam wa al-Muluk* (Oman: Daar al-Fikr, 1993), p. 308-316.

among the Muslim between the proponents of Utsman and Ali, a son-in-law to the Prophet Muhamad, faction. Later, the dissident Khawarij group that emerged following the assignation of the fourth caliph Ali, accused Muslim who submitted either to the faction of Ali and of the third caliph Utsman of being *kāfir*.[12] The group declared their refusal to *tahkīm* (arbitration) between the faction of Ali and the faction of Utsman following the Siffin war.[13] Consequently, the Khawarij launched attacks against Muslim who agreed the *tahkīm* and even assassinated whomever, including the Prophet's companions (*sahaba*), who disagreed with their stand.[14] Also, in the following century, at the end of the Umayyad and early Abbasid period, the faction of rationalist theologian, the Mu'tazilla, accused whomever disapproved their theological construction of *manzilah baina al-manzilatain* (the in-between spaces) of being *kāfir*.[15] They identified the disapproval of Muslim to their theological construct as an indication of infidelity, thus against Islam.[16] As with the earlier history, the theological difference *cum* politics within Muslim community had led to the destruction of the Muslim themselves.

Concepts of Leader[ship] in the Qur'an: *Khalīfa, ʿŪli al-ʿAmr, Imām,* and *Walīy/Awliyā'*

Beside the aspect of faith above, the Qur'an also dictates the criteria for Muslim leadership. The Quranic notions of leader and leadership are expressed into four concept: *khalīfa, imam, ūli al-amr,* and *waliy/awliyā'*.

---

[12] *Sahabat* is one who saw the prophet Muhammad and believed in him and died as a Muslim.

[13] Ahmad Muhammad Ahmad Jali, *Dirasah 'an al-Firaq fi Tarikh al-Muslimin: al-Khawarij wa as-Syi'ah* (Riyadh: Syarikah ath-Thiba'ah al-Arabiyyah as-Sa'udiyyah, 1986), p. 35.

[14] Zain al-Din Abu al-Faraj Abdurrahman bin Syihab ad-Din bin Ahmad bin Rajab al-Hambali al-Baghdadi (Ibnu Rajab), *Jami' al-Ulum wa al-Hikam fi Syarh Khamsin Hadisan min Jawami' al-Kalim* (Cairo: Daar as-Salam, 2004), p. 116-117.

[15] A mean is a place between the heaven and the hell.

[16] Mani' bin Hammad al-Juhani, *al-Mausu'ah al-Muyassarah fi al-Adyan wa al-Madzahib wa al-Ahzab al-Mu'ashirah*, Juz 1 (Riyadh: Daar an-Nadwah al-Alamiyyah li ath-Thiba'ah wa an-Nasyr wa at-Tauzi', 1420 H), p. 68.

As for the *khalīfa,* derived from the word "*khalafa-yakhlufu-khalfan"* which mean 'to replacing', the term *khalīfa* (caliph) refers to leaders following the death of the Prophet Muhammad. The *khalīfa* is responsible not only in affairs of religion, but also in public lives. It particularly appears in the Qur'an explaining responsibilities of *khalīfa* as the political ruler (*siyāsah an-nās*) of society (Shad: 26).[17] The "*siyāsah*" implies two meanings: *al-idārah* (administration) and *al-khiththah* (strategy, politics, and policy). The Qur'an also mentions the *khalīfa* as "successor" (al-Baqarah: 30). It means that a *khalīfa* is a successor of non-human beings: *bānū al-jān.*[18]

The word *khalīfa* is also appears in plural form, *khalāif,* which means that human beings as the substitute of Allah to preserve the earth (Shad: 26; al-Baqarah: 30; Fāthir: 39; Al-An'ām: 165; Yūnus 14 and 73). Its derivative word "*khalafa*" which means 'in behind' implies a subject who serve as a locomotive for betterment of human lives.[19] Historically speaking, the word *khalīfa* is used to connote Muslim leader who serve as successors of the Prophet Muhammad. Duties of *khalīfa* include affairs in religion and public lives. The *khalīfa* is the leader of Muslim community and particularly refers to four-political successors of the Prophet (*al-khulafā' al-rasyidūn,* the rightly-guided leaders): Abu Bakar Ash-Shiddiq, Umar ibn al-Khattab, Uthman ibn Affan, and Ali ibn Abi Thalib.

Another term resembling the word *khalīfa* is *ūli al-'amr.* In the Qur'an, its meanings are related to the contexts to which the word refer to and the following words that come after.[20] The word *ūli* means someone

---

[17] Thanthāwî defines the word "*Caliph*" as the person who replace others or continue as a successor. Muhammad Sayyid Thanthawi, *At-Tafsir Al-Wasith*, Maktabah Syamilah, t.t., p. 3611.

[18] In the *Tafsīr Al-Jalālain*, it has been explained that before Adam was created, the earth was inhabited by a creature named *Bānū al-Jān*. They did bad deeds which cause damage on earth. As-Suyūthî dan Al-Maḥallî, *Tafsîr Al-Jalālain*, Juz 1, (Maktabah Syamilah, t.t.), p. 36.

[19] Siti Patimah, *Manajemen Kepemimpinan Islam: Aplikasinya dalam Organisasi Pendidikan*, (Bandung: Alfabeta, 2015), p. 38-39.

[20] Jalaluddin as-Suyuthi explained that *asbab al-nuzul* of this verse related to the sending of Abdullah bin Hudzaifah ibn Qais by Rasulullah SAW to lead the war army.

who holds or possesses and "*al-'amr*" implies command and power. Thus, *ūli al-'amr* clearly points to the meaning of leader or ruler, the one who has power (an-Nisā': 59).[21] This phrase can also be interpreted as the one who holds authority. An exegete of the Qur'an, Az-Zamakhsyarî argues that *ūli al-'amr* is the leader of society, of the state or of the military unit. Another interpretation says that *ūli al-'amr* implies Muslim scholar who uphold principle of enjoining good and forbidding wrong (*'am bi al-ma'rūf wan ahī 'an al-munkar*.[22] Thus, *ūli al-'amr* is similar to the concept *'alīm* found also in the Qur'an (an-Nisā': 83). Another exegete of the Qur'an, Ar-Razi argues, there have been four meanings of *ūli al-'amr:* 1) specifically pointing to *al-khulafa' ar-rasyidun*, 2) leader in wars, 3) Muslim scholars and 4) the pure *imam* (*ma'shum*).[23]

The word "*imām*" is also a Quranic concept that implies leader. In popular mind, the word *imām* is used to mention the one who leads the Muslim prayer. The Quranic verse clearly articulates the meaning of *imām* as leader (al-Furqān: 74). The *imam* is someone who has "*qudwah*" (role model) and "*uswah*" (example).[24] Another verse points to the prophet Ibrahim as the *imām* for believers (al-Baqarah: 124). Thus, in addition to ruler or leader, the *imām* is someone who play as role model for Muslim[25] and has responsibility to lead Muslim community in general.[26]

The word '*imāma*' often conflates the concept of *imām*. These two concepts are essential to understand the theological division between

---

This verse indirectly confirms to the companions to obey Abdullah who had been given the mandate by the Prophet. Jalaluddin As-Suyuthi, *Asbabun Nuzul*, trans. Qamaruddin Shaleh (Bandung: Penerbit Diponegoro, 1975), p. 134.

[21] Ahmad Warson Munawwir, *Kamus Al-Munawwir* …, p. 38.

[22] Abû Al-Qāsim Maḥmûd bin Amrû bin Aḥmad Az-Zamakhsyarî, *Al-Kasysyāf*, Juz 5 (Maktabah Syamilah, t.th.), p. 424.

[23] Fakhruddin Ar-Razi, *At-Tafsir Al-Kabir*, 10th ed. (Beirut: Daar al-Fikr, t.th.), p. 144.

[24] Muhammad Sayyid Thanthāwî, *At-Tafsir Al-Wasith* …, p. 3146-3147.

[25] *Ibid.*, p. 202.

[26] Siti Patimah, *Manajemen Kepemimpinan Islam: Aplikasinya dalam Organisasi Pendidikan* (Bandung: Alfabeta, 2015), p. 38.

Shia and Sunni. For the Shia, *imāmah* exclusively refers to political leaders genetically related to the Prophet (*'ahl al-bayt*).[27] The Shia concept on *imāma* is similar to the concept of prophethood, because it is purely a gift from Allah, people-appointed person or based on consensus.[28] This later understanding contradicts to the Sunni's understanding on the *imām* which opens the possibility for democratically-elected leader.

Another term that is often defined as leader is the word *walīy* (in single form/*mufrad*) and *awliyā* (in plural, *jama'*). The word is derived from "*waliya-yaliy-walyan*" which means close to (something/someone). The past-tense verb (*fi'il madhi*) of the word, *walā,* implies several meanings, including mastering, managing, and commanding. The *isim fāil* (first-person subject) of the word *walaa* is *al-waliyyū* indicates also meanings: close-friend, helpers, neighbours, allies, followers, and also ruler.[29] In Islamic Sufi tradition, the meaning of *walīy* is a close-friend of God. Nevertheless, the term *walīy* also suggests political dimension connoting leadership in politics.

The word *walīy* appears 33 times in the Qur'an,[30] as does its plural form, *awliyā'*.[31] The word *walīy* is widely used to describe one of characters of God: *al-Walīyyu* (the Safeguard). The word *walīy* also implies a friend (Fushshilat: 34) which is similar to the term *hamim* (a loyal friend). As far as the Qur'an is concerned, the word *walīy* has another meaning to

---

[27] Surahman Amin & Ferry M. Siregar, "Pemimpin dan Kepemimpinan dalam Al-Qur'an", *Tanzil: Jurnal Studi Al-Quran*, Vol. 1, No. 1, 2015.

[28] Muhammad Taqi Misbah Yazdi, *Iman Semesta: Merancang Piramida Keyakinan* (Jakarta: Al-Huda, 2005), p. 290.

[29] Ahmad Warson Munawwir, *Kamus Al-Munawwir…*, p. 1582-1583.

[30] The *waliyy* term is mentioned in QS. Al-Baqarah: 107, 120, 257; Ali Imran: 68; An-Nisa': 45, 75, 89, 119, 123, 173; Al-An'am: 14, 51, 70; At-Taubah: 74, 116; Ar-Ra'd: 37; Al-Isra': 111; Al-Kahf: 17, 26; Al-'Ankabut: 32; Maryam: 5, 45; Al-Ahzab: 17, 65; As-Sajdah: 4; Fushshilat: 34; Asy-Syura: 8, 9, 28, 31, 44; Al-Fath: 22; Al-Jatsiyah: 19.

[31] The *awliya'* term is stated in QS. Ali Imran: 3; An-Nisa': 76, 89, 139, 144; Al-Maidah: 51, 57, 81; Al-A'raf: 3, 27, 30; Al-Anfal: 72, 73; At-Taubah: 23, 71; Yunus:62; Hud: 20, 113; Ar-Ra'd: 16; Al-Isra': 97; Al-Kahf: 50, 102; Al-Furqan: 18; Al-Ankabut: 41; Az-Zumar: 3; Asy-Syura: 6, 9, 46; Al-Jatsiyah: 10, 19; Al-Ahqaf: 32; Al-Mumtahanah: 1; Al-Jum'ah: 6.

its plural form, *awliyā*. The meaning of the latter includes also either as leader or friend.

The exclusive meaning of *awliyā'* referring to leader is found through a verse of the Qur'an that calls Muslim not to appoint non-Muslim as their leader (Ali Imran: 28). Other verses tell that the word *awliyā'* implies 'friend' (an-Nisa': 76, 89, 139). These verses dictate Muslim to fight the enemies of Islam and not to take these enemies as their friends. Another Quranic verse refers to two meanings at the same time. This verse that reads "*wa man yatawallahum minkum fa innahu minhum (*whoever of you [faithful] appoints them [*kāfir*] as rulers/friends, they are part of them" points to two meanings: as friend and leader (al-Maidah: 51). The word *tawallā* mentioned in this verse means either to send authority or to make friend. If we look at this verse closely and compare it to another verse with a similar wordings "*wa man yatawallahum minkum*" (At-Taubah: 23), it can be concluded that both imply different conclusion: the al-Maidah verse mention the perpetrator as unbeliever (*kafir*), whereas the At-Taubah verse labels the culprit as *fasīq* (religiously non-conforming acts).

Furthermore, if we look at the contexts of revelation (*asbāb al-nuzūl*) of Al-Maidah verse 51, there have been several versions. One version tells that the verse was revealed as a response to Ubadah ibn Ash-Shamit and Abdullah ibn Ubay ibn Salul who take the Jews as their allies. A similar story was narrated by Abu Ja'far who interpreted the verse as the prohibition for Muslim to take the Jews and the Christians as their allies.[32] Another version however tells that this verse was revealed as a response to the wish of Abu Lubab who begged the Prophet Muhammad for forgiveness (on behalf of the Qurayza who had abused the Prophet).[33]

---

[32] *Ibid.*, p. 400.
[33] Ibnu Jarir Ath-Thabariy, *Tafsir Ath-Thabariy…*, p. 398.

Criteria of Leaders: A Quranic Perspective

Apart from multiple concepts related to the concept of leader and leadership in the Qur'an, the scripture indeed has laid important principles for Muslim leadership. *First*, having a firm faith in Allah (al-Anbiyā': 73). A leader, according to this verse, serves as a binder as well as a liaison between human beings and Allah in terms of spirituality. Another verse also explains that, through the term *khalāif,* explicitly states the presence of threat that unbeliever, thus Muslim should not appoint unbelievers as their political leader, *imām* (Fathir: 39).[34]

Second, a leader must fulfil the criteria of justice and trustworthy (an-Nisa': 58). This verse rules out that a leader must be ensured to hold the mandate entrusted to him and to be fair in his decision and in formulating policies. Al-Maraghiy further elaborates that responsibilities of leader include human responsibility to Allah, responsibility to fellow human beings, and responsibility to the leader himself.[35] In another verse, the Qur'an prohibits a leader to betray Allah and His Prophet Muhammad which could lead to the abrogation of leadership mandate (al-Anfal: 27). This later verse clearly suggests that a leadership is indeed a sacred treaty: between the leader and Allah and His Prophet.

Third, the Qur'an also dictates that a leader should be the best among the community and should take the Prophet Muhammad as his ultimate example (al-Baqarah: 124). A leader should be able to unite as does the Prophet Muhammad who successfully differences within the Muslim community.[36] And *fourth*, a leader must be able to exercise deliberation and consultation through the words "*wa amruhum syūrā*

---

[34] Surahman Amin & Ferry M. Siregar, "Pemimpin dan Kepemimpinan dalam Al-Qur'an", *Tanzil: Jurnal Studi Al-Quran*, Vol. 1, No. 1, 2015, pp. 34.

[35] Surahman Amin & Ferry M. Siregar, "Pemimpin dan Kepemimpinan dalam Al-Qur'an"…, pp. 36-37.

[36] Surahman Amin & Ferry M. Siregar, "Pemimpin dan Kepemimpinan dalam Al-Qur'an"…, p. 37.

bainahum" (asy-Syūrā: 38).[37] There have been many examples that the Prophet Muhammad performed for the practice of deliberation and consultation. As far as the Qur'an is concerned, this is particularly true to the affairs related to public lives, but not to the affairs of God-human relation (*ibada*) (an-Naml: 32-34; Āli 'Imrān: 159). And finally, the Qur'an also dictates that a leader must be an intelligentsia (al-Baqarah: 247). This verse explains, through the story of Thalut, the king of Israelite, a leader has to be renowned for his physical strengths and his intellectual capacity.[38]

Muslim Political Experiments: Appointing Leaders in the Early Islamic History

Following the death of the Prophet Muhammad, Muslim exercised different methods to elect their leader. This is particularly because there has been no defined-rules on how Muslim elect their leader. The absence of defined-rules, in Islamic discussion, implies that method of selecting leader (*nashb al-imāmah)* is an affair of Muslim deliberation (*ijtihād*) and it is a matter of interpretation (*zhannīy al-dilālah*). The Islamic history records at least four models for Muslim selecting their leader; direct appointment by Muslim community, direct appointment by preceding leader, appointment by a limited number of Muslim communities, and inherited system of leadership

The early Islamic history demonstrates the first Muslim election occurred following the dead of the Prophet Muhammad. The history tells that the *Anshar* (indigenous Medinan) gathered to appoint the leader from their group and the representatives of the Khazraj tribe proposed Sa'ad ibn Ubadah as the successor for the Prophet Rasulullah to rule the Muslim in Medina, but the family of Aus (*banī* Aus) sect contested

---

[37] "*When believers are confronted with important issues that need to be re-examined, they will gather and deliberate to decide on policies to be taken, which are more likely to bring benefits.*" Muhammad Sayyid Thanthāwî, *At-Tafsir Al-Wasith* …, p. 3774.

[38] Muhammad Sayyid Thanthāwî, *At-Tafsir Al-Wasith* …, p. 453.

Sa'ad's candidacy.[39] Hubab ibn al-Munzir on the other hand proposed that Muslims chose one leader from the Anshar and one leader from the *Muhajirin* (the Mecca migrants in Medina), but Umar refused the idea and argued that "there are no two leaders at the same time and territory."[40] The Prophet's companions, Abu Ubadah ibn Jarrah, Bashir ibn Sa'ad and Abu Bakar, later offered the Muslim to choose either Abu Ubadah or Umar ibn al-Khattab as their leader. Nonetheless, the Muslim, compromising the *Anshar* and the *Muhajirin,* refused the offer and later agreed to elect Abu Bakar as their leader.[41] This episode was the earliest recorded history of Muslim voting for their leader with which they voluntarily sent their allegiance to the leadership of Abu Bakar, the first *khalifa* in Islamic political history.

Unlike the Prophet Muhammad who did not determine his successor, Abu Bakar appointed Umar ibn al-Khattab as the caliph. Worried by the possible disunity among the Muslim, Abu Bakar invited Utsman bin Affan to write his decision assigning Umar bin Khattab as the first caliph successor. Nevertheless, this is not to say that Abu Bakar ruled his decision altogether because it had been an advice of his trustful companions to assign Umar as his successor.[42] The appointment of Umar bin Khattab was the first Muslim political experiment to select their leader based on the previous leader's decision.

The early Islamic history also records the selection of leader by a limited Muslim-committee. This particularly occurred following the failed-attempt to kill the second caliph, Umar bin Khattab. The caliph later invited six other Prophets' companion, which includes Uthman ibn Affan, Ali ibn Abi Talib, Talha ibn Ubaidillah, Zubayr ibn Awwam, Sa'ad ibn Abi Waqqash, and Abdurrahman ibn Auf, to discuss his successor

---

[39] J. Suyuti Pulung, *Fiqh Siyasah* (Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada Utama, 1994), p. 103.

[40] *Ibid.,* p. 104-105.

[41] *Ibid.*, pp. 105-106.

[42] Ali Mufrodi, *Islam di Kawasan Kebudayaan Arab* (Jakarta: Logos, 1997), p. 53.

as the caliph. Umar was convinced that these six important figures are promising candidates for the third caliph. Nevertheless, Umar never ruled out his successor until his dead.[43] Following the death of Umar, these six later agreed that the leadership of Muslim community went to either Uthman ibn Affan or Ali ibn Abi Talib. Particularly because of seniority and age, Uthman was appointed as the third caliph succeeding Umar.[44]

The appointment of Utsman as the third caliph perhaps becomes an importance reference for Muslim to elect their leader by a limited number of experts. It serves the foundation of currently known as the concept of '*ahl al-halli wa al-'aqdi* (the people of loosing and binding) in Sunni-Islam. This concept is often confronted to the Shia-Islam of the *imāma* which is limited to the descendants of the Prophet to serve as ruler. The model of leader selection by a limited number of experts continued to the leadership transition from the Utsman to Ali bin Abi Thalib, the fourth caliph in early Islamic history.[45]

The above leadership transitions of *al-khulāfa' al-rasyidūn*, from the first to the fourth caliph, surely mirrors a degree of democratic model in early Islamic history. However, the monarchy model later replaced the first Muslim experience of democracy as leadership was based on inheritance system of Muslim monarchs. The leaders of Ummayyad dynasty who ruled Muslim communities later directly appointed leader for the Muslim. The leadership had been inherited through the lineage

---

[43] Munawir Sjadzali, *Islam dan Tata Negara* …, p. 25.

[44] Adeng Muchtar Ghazali, *Perjalanan Politik Umat Islam dalam Lintasan Sejarah* (Bandung: Pustaka Setia, 2004), p. 21.

[45] However, the political conditions faced by Ali and his followers were far more complex. Therefore, the appointment of Ali occurred after the murder of Uthman ibn Affan. Likewise, Ali's allegiance was also marked by rejection and denial by Mu'awiyah ibn Abi Sufyan, the Sham governor, who in fact was Uthman's family. Mu'awiyah argued that Ali's obedience was invalid for several reasons, namely: *first*, Ali had to be responsible for the killing of Uthman by arresting the murderer. *Second*, Islamic power had expanded, the determination of leadership was no longer the right of companions which lived in Medina. See, Munawir Sjadzali, *Islam dan Tata Negara: Ajaran, Sejarah, dan Pemikian*, (Jakarta: UI-Press, 1993), pp. 27-28.

of the ruler, the *bani Ummayyad* (the sons of Ummayyad).[46] This later method had been maintained by following Muslim dynasties, from the Abbasids and the Ottoman.

Conclusion

This article has demonstrated a Quranic view of Muslim leadership and important principles underpinning Muslim voting for their leader. Nevertheless, the Qur'an also open for various interpretations regarding non-Muslim in politics which had been a backbone for the political tension over the 2017 Jakarta Governor election. The controversies on the question of a non-Muslim as political leader ruling a majority of Muslim should be analysed from the Quranic perspective which open for multiple interpretations. Apart from the controversies, in current democratic system, the Qur'an has laid foundation for leadership which include a firm faith for Muslim leader, intellectual capacity, the best person among the Muslim, and capable to upload principles of justice. As far as the early Islamic political history concerned, it can be concluded the absence of definite-model for Muslim politics. The political experiments of early Muslim community demonstrated a model of currently known as democratic system which was later replaced by monarchy. Thus, political model for the Muslim is indeed a matter of interpretation. Muslim may give an interpretation to the best model for themselves at the age so long as contributing to the betterment of the Muslim community, the nation and its citizens, regardless their religious identities and affiliations.

---

[46] *Ibid.*, p. 52.

Bibliography

Al-Asfahani, Ar-Raghib, *Mufradat li Alfazh Al-Qur'an*, Damaskus: Daar al-Qalam, 1992.

Al-Dimasyqiy, Abu Al-Fida' Ismail bin Katsir, *Tafsir Al-Qur'an Al-Azhim*, Juz IV, Semarang: Thaha Putra, t.t.

Al-Farmawi, Abdul Hayy, *Metode Tafsir Maudhu'i*, Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada, 1996.

Al-Hambali, Zain Al-Din Abu Al-Faraj Abdurrahman bin Syihab Ad-Din bin Ahmad bin Rajab (Ibnu Rajab), *Jami' al-Ulum wa al-Hikam fi Syarh Khamsin Hadisan min Jawami' al-Kalim*, Cairo: Daar as-Salam, 2004.

Al-Juhani, Mani' bin Hammad, *al-Mausu'ah al-Muyassarah fi al-Adyan wa al-Madzahib wa al-Ahzab al-Mu'ashirah*, Riyadh: Daar an-Nadwah al-Alamiyyah li ath-Thiba'ah wa an-Nasyr wa at-Tauzi', 1420 H.

Al-Qurthubiy, Abu Abdillah, *Tafsir al-Qurthubiy*, Cairo: Daar asy-Syiab, 1372 H.

Amin, Surahman & Ferry M. Siregar, "Pemimpin dan Kepemimpinan dalam Al-Qur'an", *Tanzil: Jurnal Studi Al-Quran*, Vol. 1, No. 1, October 2015.

Ar-Razi, Abu Husain Ahmad bin Faris bin Zakariya bin Hubaib, *Mu'jam Muqayis al-Lughah*, Kairo: Maktabah al-Kanji, 1981.

Ar-Razi, Fakhruddin, *At-Tafsir Al-Kabir*, Beirut: Daar al-Fikr, t.t.

As-Suyūthî, Jalal Ad-din dan Jalal Ad-din Al-Mahallî, *Tafsîr Al-Jalālain*, Maktabah Syamilah, t.t.

As-Suyuthi, Jalal Ad-din, *Asbabun Nuzul*, translated by Qamaruddin Shaleh et al. from *Lubab an-Nuqul fi Asbab an-Nuzul*, Bandung: Penerbit Diponegoro, 1975.

Ath-Thabariy, Ibnu Jarir, *Tafsir Ath-Thabariy*, Maktabah Syamilah, t.t.

Az-Zamakhsyarî, Abû Al-Qāsim Mahmûd bin Amrû bin Ahmad, *Al-Kasysyāf*, Juz 5, Maktabah Syamilah, t.t.

Baidan, Nashruddin, *Metodologi Penafsiran Al-Qur'an*, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 1998.

Cawidu, Harifuddin, *Konsep Kufr dalam Al-Qur'an: Suatu Kajian Teologis dengan Pendekatan Tafsir Tematik*, Jakarta: Penerbit Bulan Bintang, 1991.

Departemen Pendidikan Nasional, *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia*, Jakarta: Balai Pustaka, 2002.

Ghazali, Adeng Muchtar, *Perjalanan Politik Umat Islam dalam Lintasan Sejarah*, Bandung: Pustaka Setia, 2004.

Jali, Ahmad Muhammad Ahmad, *Dirasah 'an al-Firaq fi Tarikh al-Muslimin: al-Khawarij wa as-Syi'ah*, Riyadh: Syarikah ath-Thiba'ah al-Arabiyyah as-Sa'udiyyah, 1986.

Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia Luar Jaringan (Luring).

Khuraisat, Shalih, *Tahdzib Tarikh at-Thabari: Tarikh al-Umam wa al-Muluk*, Oman: Daar al-Fikr, 1993.

Mufrodi, Ali, *Islam di Kawasan Kebudayaan Arab*, Jakarta: Logos, 1997.

Munawwir, Ahmad Warson, *Kamus Al-Munawwir*, Surabaya: Pustaka Progessif, t.t.

Patimah, Siti, *Manajemen Kepemimpinan Islam: Aplikasinya dalam Organisasi Pendidikan*, Bandung: Penerbit Alfabeta, 2015.

Pulungan, J. Suyuti, *Fiqh Siyasah*, Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada Utama, 1994.

Rofiq, Moh., "Konsep Kufr dalam Al-Qur'an", *Jurnal Sahaja*, Vol. 4, No. 2, 2013.

Sjadzali, Munawir, *Islam dan Tata Negara: Ajaran, Sejarah, dan Pemikian*, Jakarta: UI-Press, 1993.

Thanthawi, Muhammad Sayyid, *At-Tafsir Al-Wasith*, Maktabah Syamilah, t.t.

Tim Sembilan, *Tafsir Maudhu'i Al-Muntaha*, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pesantren, 2004.

Yazdi, Muhammad Taqi Misbah, *Iman Semesta: Merancang Piramida Keyakinan*, Jakarta: Al-Huda, 2005.

Zakariya, Abu Husain Ahmad bin Faris bin, *Mu'jam Maqayis al-Lughah*, Mesir: Isa al-Bab al-Halab wa Awladuh, 1972.